

Appendixes

Appendix A: *Participant List*

Appendix B: *Consultation Agenda*

Appendix C: *Selected Readings on Ethical Issues in
Microbicide Development*



Appendix A

PARTICIPANT LIST

International Consultation on Ethical Issues in the Clinical Testing of Microbicides

Council on Foundations

October 23–24, 2003

Amy Allina

National Women's Health Network
514 Tenth Street, NW 4th floor
Washington, DC 20004
(tel) 202 347 1140
(email) aallina@womenshealthnetwork.org

Emily Bass

IAVI
110 Williams Street, 27th Fl
New York, NY 10038
(tel) 212 847 1051
(email) ebass@iavi.org

Eduard J. Beck

McGill University, Purvis Hall
1020 Pine Avenue West
H3A 1A2, Montreal, Canada.
(tel) + 1 514 398 6271
(email) eduard.beck@mcgill.ca

Rafia Bhore

Center for Drug Evaluation & Research
FDA
9201 Corporate Boulevard, HFD-725
Rockville, MD 20850
(tel) 301 827 2373
(e-mail) bhorer@cder.fda.gov

Debra Birnkrant

Center for Drug Evaluation & Research
FDA
9201 Corporate Blvd
Gaithersburg, MD 20850
(tel) 301 827 2330
(email) birnkrant@cder.fda.gov

Marianne Callahan

CONRAD
1611 N. Kent Street, #806
Arlington, VA 22209
(tel) 703 276 3915
(email) mcallahan@conrad.org

Marge Chigwanda

15 Phillips Avenue, Belgravia
Harare, Zimbabwe
(tel) 263 4 704920
(email) marge@uz-ucsf.co.zw

Kata Chillag

HIV Epidemiology Branch
CDC, MS E45
8 Corporate Blvd
Atlanta, GA 30329
(tel) 404 639 0948
(email) kchillag@cdc.gov

Brendon Christian

Gender AIDS Forum
Suite 817 Sangro House
417 Smith Street, Durban
South Africa 4000
(tel) +27 31 3077723/5
(email) Brendon_Christian@hotmail.com

Lee Claypool

USAID
1300 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20523-3601
(tel) 202 712 0334
(email) lclaypool@usaid.gov

Anne Coletti

Family Health International
52 Washington Street
Reading, MA 01867
(tel) 781 779 1511
(email) acoletti@fhi.org

Lorna Colquhoun

MRC/DFID Microbicides Development
Programme (MDP)
Clinical Trials Centre, St. Mary's Campus,
Imperial College London
Norfolk Place, London W2 1PG, UK
(tel) 44 0 20 7886 6787
(email) l.colquhoun@imperial.ac.uk

Liza Dawson

Fogarty International Center
National Institutes of Health
16 Center Drive MSC 6705
Bethesda, MD 20892-6705
(tel) 301 496 1739
(email) dawsonl@mail.nih.gov

Kim Dickson

University of Witwatersrand
Chris Hani Baragwanath Hospital
PO Bertsham 2013
Soweto, South Africa
Current address:
DFID Nigeria
Plot 607
Bobo St (Off Gana)
Maitama, Abuja
Nigeria
(tel) +234 0 9 413 7710
(email) K-Dickson@dfid.gov.uk

Tim Farley

World Health Organization
Avenia Appia
1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland
(tel) +41 22 791 3310
(email) farleyt@who.int

Barbara Friedland

Population Council
1 Dag Hammarskjold Plaza
New York, NY 10017
(tel) 212 339 0629
(email) bfriedland@popcouncil.org

Megan Gottemoeller

Global Campaign for Microbicides
1800 K Street, NW Suite 800
Washington, DC 20006
(tel) 202 822 0033
(email) mgottemoeller@path-dc.org

Forrest C. Greenslade

149 Tinderwood
Farrington Post, NC 27312
(tel) 919 545 9743
(email) fcg@forrestgreenslade.com

Vera Grigorieva

Clinical Research Department
Family Health International
(tel) 919 544 7040, ext. 390
(email): vgrigorieva@fhi.org

Michael Gross

1601 18th St., NW Ste. 716
Washington, D.C. 20009
(tel) 202 232 2766
(email) m144@earthlink.net

Polly Harrison

Alliance for Microbicide Development
8484 Georgia Avenue, Suite 940
Silver Spring, MD 20910
(tel) 301 588 8091
(email) pharrison@microbicide.org

Lori Heise

Global Campaign for Microbicides
1800 K Street, NW Suite 800
Washington, DC 20006
(tel) 202 822 0033
(email) lheise@path-dc.org



Carel Ijsselmuiden

School of Health Systems and Public Health,
Faculty of Health Sciences, University of
Pretoria

New contact information:

Council on Health Research for Development
(COHRED)

11, rue de Cornavin
1201 Geneva, Switzerland
(tel) +41 22 591 8900
(email) Carel@cohred.ch

Jerry Jennings

RRB; USAID; GH/OHA
1300 Pennsylvania Ave, NW
Washington, DC 20523
(tel) 202-712-1084
(email) gjennings@usaid.gov

Neelam Sanjay Joglekar

National AIDS Research Institute
73 'G' block MIDC
Bhosari Pune 411026
Maharashtra, India
(tel) 011 91 20 7121342/43
(email) joglekarneelam@yahoo.com

Elof Johansson

Population Council
1230 York Avenue
New York, NY 10021
(tel) 212 327 8717
(email) e-johansson@popcbr.rockefeller.edu

Heidi Jones

Population Council
One Dag Hammarskjold Plaza
New York, NY 10017
(tel) 212 339 0658
(email) hjones@popcouncil.org

Anatoli Kamali

MRC Programme on AIDS in Uganda
Plot 51-59, Nakiwogo Road
PO Box 49
Entebbe, Uganda
(tel) 256 (0) 41 320 272
(email) anatoli.kamali@mrcuganda.org

Miriam Katende

TASO Headquarters
PO Box 10443
Kampala, Uganda
(tel) 256 77 767 637
(email) katendepm@yahoo.com

Marc-Andre LeBlanc

Canadian AIDS Society
309 Cooper St., 4th floor
Ottawa ON K2P 0G5
Canada
(tel) 613 230 3580
(email) marcl@cdnaids.ca

Reidar Lie

Department of Clinical Bioethics
National Institutes of Health
10 Center Drive Building 10
Room 1C118
Bethesda, MD 20892-1156
(tel) 301 496 2429
(email) RLie@mail.cc.nih.gov

Naomi Lince

Ibis Reproductive Health
2 Brattle Square
Cambridge, MA 02125
(tel) 617 349 0042
(email) nlince@ibisreproductivehealth.org

Alex John London

Department of Philosophy
135 Baker Hall
Carnegie Mellon University
Pittsburgh, PA 15213-3890
(tel) 412 268 4938
(email) ajlondon@andrew.cmu.edu

Kathleen MacQueen

Family Health International
PO Box 13950
Research Triangle Park, NC 27709
(tel) 919 544 7040 ext. 587
(email) kmacqueen@fhi.org

Esther Maleka

c/o Medunsa
PO Box 211
Medunsa, South Africa
(tel) +27 12 521 4251

Petronella Mabitso Marumo

c/o Medunsa
PO Box 211
Medunsa, South Africa
(tel) +27 12 521 4251
(email) bitso@medunsa.ac.za

L. Camille Massey

International AIDS Vaccine Initiative
110 William Street, 27 Floor
New York, NY 10038
(tel) 212 847 1047
(email) cmassey@iavi.org

Elizabeth McGrory

Consultant
24 Second Ave
Nyack, NY 10960
(tel) 845 353 0902
(email) emcgrory@ipm-microbicides.org

Sophia Mukasa Monico

Global Health Council
1701 K Street Suite 600
Washington, DC 20006
(tel) 202 833 5900 ext. #3235
(email) smukasamonico@globalhealth.org

Barbara Moscicki

University of California, San Francisco
3333 California Ave. Suite 245
San Francisco, CA. 94118-0503
(tel) 415 476 5139
(email) annam@itsa.ucsf.edu

Promise A.C. Mthembu

ICW, c/o Gender AIDS Forum
108 SANGRO House
517 Smith Street
Durban 4001, South Africa
(tel) +27 31 3071253
(email) pmtthembu@icw.org

Margaret Kanya Muganwa

Makerere University Institute
of Public Health
PO Box 40382
Kampala, Uganda
(tel) 256 77 469880
(email) mmuganwa@hotmail.com

Paula Munderi

MRC Programme on AIDS
Uganda Virus Research Institute
P O Box 49
Entebbe, Uganda
(tel) + 256 41 281/4
(email) paula.munderi@mrcuganda.org

Shyamala Nataraj

c/o South India AIDS Action Programme
NO. 4, First Street, Kamaraj Avenue
Adyar, Chennai, Tammil Nadu, India
(tel) 044 24416141
(email) shyamnats@hotmail.com



Busisiwe Nkala

Department of Obstetrics & Gynaecology
Chris Hani Baragwanath Hospital
P.O. Bertsham, 2013
Soweto, Johannesburg.
(tel) +27 11 933 1228 ext. 206
(email) b.nkala@rhrujhb.co.za

Malcolm Potts

School of Public Health
University California, Berkeley
Warren Hall, # 314
Berkeley, CA 94707
(tel) 510 642 6915
(email) potts@socrates.berkeley.edu

Renee Ridzon

Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation
PO Box 23350
Seattle, WA 98102
(tel) 206 709 3383
(email) reneer@gatesfoundation.org

Audrey Smith Rogers

NICHD
6100 Executive Blvd. 4B11K
Rockville, MD 20852
(tel) 301 435 6873
(email) rogersa@mail.nih.gov

Zeda Rosenberg

International Partnership for Microbicides
1010 Wayne Avenue, Suite 510
Silver Spring, MD 20910
(tel) 301 608 2221
(email) zrosenberg@ipm-microbicides.org

Shira Saperstein

Moriah Fund
1634 I Street, NW Suite 1000
Washington, DC 20006
(tel) 202 783 8488
(email) ssaperstein@moriahfund.org

Brooke L. Shearer

International Partnership for Microbicides
1010 Wayne Avenue, Suite 510
Silver Spring, MD 20910
(tel) 301 608 2221
(email) blshearer07@aol.com

Stephanie Skoler

Population Council
1230 York Avenue
New York, NY 10021
(tel) 212 327 7003
(email) sskoler@popcouncil.org

Catherine Slack

HIVAIDS Vaccines Ethics Group
School of Psychology
University of Natal, Pietermaritzburg 3209
KwaZuluNatal, South Africa
(tel) 27 33 260 6166
(email) Slackca@nu.ac.za

Dawn Smith

BOTUSA Project
Plot 5348
Ditlhakore Way
PO Box90
Extension 12
Gaborone, Botswana
(tel) 267 390 1696
(email) dks0@botusa.org

Harris Solomon

Office of Population and Reproductive
Health, Bureau for Global Health, USAID
1300 Pennsylvania Ave NW
Washington, DC 20523-3601
(tel) 202 712 1841
(email) hsolomon@usaid.gov

Alan Stone

38 Hollycroft Avenue
London NW3 7QN
United Kingdom
(tel) 44 207 431 8532
(email) alan.stonex@virgin.net

Laurie Sylla

19 Morris Causeway
New Haven, CT 06512
(tel) 203 737 2361
(email) laurie.sylla@yale.edu

Amanda Troxler

Family Health International
2224 E. NC Hwy S4
Durham, NC 27713
(tel) 919 544 7040 ext. 301
(email) atroxler@fhi.org

Lut Van Damme

CONRAD
1611 N. Kent Street, #806
Arlington, VA 22209
(tel) 703 276 4020
(email) lvandamme@conrad.org

Rebekah Webb

Flat 2, 56 Norton Road
Hove
East Sussex BN3 3BH
United Kingdom
(tel) +44 0 1273 240489
(email) rwebb@global-campaign.org

Susan Wood

Ford Foundation
Suites 1502 - 1503 - 1504, 15th Floor
Vietcombank Tower
198 Tran Quang Khai Street
Hoan Kiem District
Hanoi, Vietnam
(tel) 84 4 934 9766/7/8/9
(email) swood@fordfound.org

Cynthia Woodsong

Family Health International
PO 13905
Research Triangle Park, NC 27709
(tel) 919 544 7040 ext. 448
(email) cwoodsong@fhi.org

Teresa C. Wu

Center for Drug Evaluation & Research
FDA
9201 Corporate Blvd
Gaithersburg, MD 20850
(tel) 301 827 2359
(email) wut@cderr.fda.gov



Appendix B

CONSULTATION AGENDA

Pre-Meeting on Clinical Trials and Ethical Reasoning

October 22, 2003

PATH

1800 K Street, NW, Suite 800

Washington, DC

Prior to the consultation the Global Campaign for Microbicides sponsored a one-day pre-meeting on clinical trials and ethical reasoning. This course, now available upon request, is designed to familiarize participants with the basics of clinical trial design; provide background data on ethical guidance and principles; and provide an opportunity, through case studies, to apply these principles in practice.

- | | |
|---------------------|---|
| 1:00 to 1:30 | Welcome and Introductions |
| 1:30 to 2:15 | Overview of Clinical Trials |
| 2:15 to 2:50 | Introduction to Ethical Reasoning (Part 1) |
| 3:00 to 3:30 | Informed Consent Case Study |
| 3:30 to 3:45 | Ethical Reasoning (Part 2) |
| 4:00 to 5:00 | Vaccine Trial Case Study |

International Consultation on Ethical Issues in the Clinical Testing of Microbicides

October 23, 2003

Council on Foundations

1828 L Street, NW, Suite 505

Washington, DC

Day One:

- | | |
|-------------|--|
| 8:30 | Welcome and Introductions |
| | Kim Dickson, Reproductive Health Research Unit, South Africa
Steering Committee, Global Campaign for Microbicides |

9:00 Contextualizing the Field Since the 1997 Ethics Consultation

Lori Heise, Director, Global Campaign for Microbicides

Meeting goals and agenda; history of the earlier consultation; shifts that emerged in thinking and strategy because of the 1997 consultation; significant events that have occurred since that time; and the evolution of HPTN ethics guidance.

9:15 Design Issues in Clinical Trials of Microbicides

Alan Stone, International Working Group on Microbicides, UK

Basic introduction to the design of microbicide trials; clinical trial pathway for microbicides; and discussion of key challenges: finding a placebo; selection of trial populations. Why are most microbicide trials in the developing world? Measuring effectiveness versus efficacy; and challenges of measuring sexual behavior, gel and condom use. Current controversies: one control arm or two? Length of participant follow-up.

9:45 International Research Ethics and Debates

Carel IJsselmuiden, University of Pretoria, South Africa

Historical origins of modern bioethics. Introduction to ethical reasoning and key principles. What makes research ethical? Basic concepts and principles; debates over universal versus pluralistic standards of care; and recent controversy around placebo-controlled trials. Dealing with culture and community. What makes HIV prevention trials different—stigma, healthy individuals, etc.?

10:30 Session 1: Informed Consent: From Theory to Practice

Marge Chigwanda, UZ-UCSF Collaborative Research Program, Zimbabwe
Cynthia Woodsong, Family Health International, USA

Discussion of the microbicide field's efforts to address informed consent. Issues that remain; examples of creative approaches to achieving and sustaining informed consent, including videos, assessment of comprehension, etc.

11:30 Session 2: Benefits and Burdens to Participants and Communities—Conceptualizing Fair Benefits

Reidar Lie, National Institutes of Health, USA/Norway

Evolution of ethical thinking on this issue; insights from guidance; balancing risks and benefits; NIH consultation on fair benefits; balancing benefits and “undue inducement;” What is the difference between inducement and “undue” inducement? Ensuring reasonable availability of interventions post trial.

**1:15 Session 2: (Continued): Benefits and Burdens
Evaluating Carraguard—A look at burdens and benefits from multiple vantage points**

Heidi Jones, Population Council—General reflections
Barbara Friedland—Population Council—Phase II coordinator
Mabitso Marumo—counseling coordinator, MEDUNSA
Esther Maleka, Former Phase II trial participant, South Africa
Discussant: Alex London, Carnegie Mellon University



3:00 **Session 3: Defining the Standard of Care**
Considering Standard of Care from a Research Ethics Perspective

Liza Dawson, Fogarty International Center

Multiple uses of this concept; insights from Guidance; context of global health inequities; moral basis of standard of care debates; health care versus research ethics; international debates and tensions (local standard; best proven; highest attainable and sustainable; ratcheting up).

Ethics Meets the Rough Grounds

Kathleen MacQueen, HPTN Ethics Working Group

Defining the range of care issues at stake (beyond ARVs). Insights from FHI's SOC survey at HPTN sites—variations between care available in different settings. Findings of how HPTN 035 participants conceptualize "fair."

Discussants: Anatoli Kamali (MRC-Uganda), Miriam Katende (TASO), Promise Mthembu, ICW.

Day Two:

8:30 **Session 4: Men, Ethics and Microbicide Trials**
What are the issues? How is the field responding?

Panel discussion:

Busisiwe Nkala, Soweto, South Africa

Neelam Joglekar, Pune, India

Michael Gross, consultant, USA

Experience from audience members

Concerns about penile safety; expectations around men's right to control female behavior; issues around trials "excluding" men, partner consent, etc.

Discussants: Ethical- and rights-based reflections on men, culture, and trials

Carel IJsselmuiden—University of Pretoria

Brendon Christian—Gender AIDS Forum, South Africa

10:15 **Session 5: HIV Treatment in the Context of Prevention Trials**
Introduction to On-Going Deliberations and Debates

Lori Heise, Global Campaign for Microbicides

Providing ART: Examining the ethical arguments

Catherine Slack, University of Natal, South Africa

Scientific and Practical Challenges of Treating HIV Infections

Paula Munderi, MRC Uganda

WHO/UNAIDS Consultation on ART in Prevention Trials

Eduard Beck, McGill University, Canada

Opportunities to Partner and Leverage Outside Resources

Camille Massey, International AIDS Vaccine Initiative

Discussion

1:30 Session 6: Establishing Safety and Effectiveness in Younger Adolescents

Younger Adolescents: Do We Need Separate Data?

Barbara Moscicki, Division of Adolescent Medicine, UCSF

Ethical Reflections on Enrolling Adolescents in Trials

Audrey Rogers, NICHD Adolescent Clinical Trial Unit

A View from Botswana

Dawn Smith, BOTUSA Project, Gaborone, Botswana
Discussion

3:00 Session 7: Ethics of Second-Generation Microbicide Trials

If a RCT demonstrates some effectiveness for a first-generation product what implications would this have on the design of future trials. What role can post-approval trials play? Under what circumstances could we ethically do a confirmatory trial in a different setting?

Equipoise and the Issue of Second-Generation Trials

Alex London, Carnegie Mellon University

Scientific Challenges in Testing Next-Generation Products

Anne Coletti, Family Health International

The Potential Role for Post-Approval Studies

Forrest Greenslade, Consultant
Discussant: Tim Farley, World Health Organization

5:00 Summary Reflections and Rapporteur Report

Kim Dickson, South Africa



Appendix C

SELECTED READINGS ON ETHICAL ISSUES IN MICROBICIDE DEVELOPMENT

Contextualizing the Field Since 1997

Heise L, McGrory E, Wood S. *Practical and Ethical Dilemmas in the Clinical Testing of Microbicides: A Report on a Symposium*. New York: International Women's Health Coalition; 1998.

MacQueen K, Sugarman J. Back to the rough ground: working in international HIV prevention as ethical debates continue. *IRB: Ethics and Human Research*. 2003;25(2): 11–13.

MacQueen K, Sugarman J. *HIV Prevention Trials Network: Ethics Guidance for Research*. Arlington Virginia: HPTN Ethics Working Group; 2003.

Lo B, Bayer R. Establishing ethical trials for treatment and prevention of AIDS in developing countries. *British Medical Journal*. 2003;327:337-339.

→ 74

Background Materials on Microbicides and Clinical Trials

Harrison P, Rosenberg Z, and Bowcut, J. Topical microbicides for disease prevention: status and challenges. *Clinical Infectious Disease*. 2003;36:1290–1294.

Stone A. Clinical trials of microbicides. *The Microbicide Quarterly*. 2003;1(2):13–18. Available at: <http://www.microbicide.org/microbicideinfo/reference/final.TMQ.jul.aug.sep.2003.pdf>

Background Materials on Biomedical Ethics

Emanuel E, Wendler D, Killen J, Grady C. What makes clinical research in developing countries ethical? The benchmarks of ethical research. *Journal of Infectious Diseases*. 2004;189:930–937.

Nuffield Council on Bioethics. The ethics of research related to health care in developing countries: Follow up discussion paper. London: Nuffield Council; 2005. Available at: http://www.nuffieldbioethics.org/fileLibrary/pdf/HRRDC_Follow-up_Discussion_Paper001.pdf

Informed Consent

Lindegger G, Richter LM. HIV vaccines trials: critical issues in informed consent. *South African Journal of Science*. 2000;96:313–318.

Molyneux CS, Wassenaar DR, Peshu N, Marsh K. Even if they ask you to stand by a tree all day, you will have to do it (laughter)...!: Community voices on the notion and practice of informed consent for biomedical research in developing countries. *Social Science and Medicine*. 2005, 61: 443-454.

Standard of Care

Benetar SR, Singer PA. A new look at international research ethics. *British Medical Journal*. 2000;321:824–826.

Lie RK, Emanuel E, Grady C, Wendler, D. The standard of care debate: the Declaration of Helsinki versus the international consensus opinion. *Journal of Medical Ethics*. 2004; 30:190–193.

Shapiro K, Benetar SR. HIV prevention research and global inequality: steps towards improved standards of care. *Journal of Medical Ethics*. 2005;31:39–47.

HIV Treatment in the Context of Prevention Trials

Berkley S. Thorny issues in the ethics of AIDS vaccine trials. *The Lancet*. 2003;362.

Bass E. HIV Treatment in the Context of HIV Prevention Trial. Proceedings of a meeting cosponsored by the Global Campaign for Microbicides and the International AIDS Vaccine Initiative, Washington DC, February 28, 2003. Available at: <http://www.global-campaign.org/clientfiles/ethicsreport.pdf>

Slack C, Stobie M, Milford C, Lindegger G, Wassenaar D, Strode A, Ijsselmuiden C. Provision of HIV treatment in HIV preventive vaccine trials: A developing country perspective. *Social Science and Medicine*. 2005;60:1197–1208.

WHO/UNAIDS. Treating people with intercurrent infection in HIV prevention trials: report of a WHO/UNAIDS consultation. *AIDS*. 2004;18(15):W1-W12.

